



Risk Management Policy

Approved May 25, 2005

1.0 Policy

It is the policy of the ABAG PLAN Corporation (PLAN) to prudently manage its programs to minimize the frequency and severity of losses incurred by its members. We will achieve this by requiring members to implement a risk management program that meets accepted standards for controlling the types of losses covered by the PLAN.

2.0 Scope

This Risk Management Policy applies to activities of the PLAN with regard to risk management standards for the Liability and Property Programs. Terms with special meaning are defined in the “Definitions” section of this policy.

3.0 Objectives

It is the objective of this policy to implement a process that will effectively identify and analyze risks, establish recommended strategies for treating those risks, provide assistance and resources for implementing the strategies, monitor their effectiveness, and provide incentives to maintain and improve the results. These objectives will be met through a combination of the following activities:

1. Establish criteria for admission and continued membership
2. Monitor compliance with and effectiveness of criteria
3. Provide resources, incentives, and technical expertise to assist members in maintaining and improving their risk management policies and procedures

3.1 Establish Criteria

A. Admission. Prospective new members will be evaluated by the Risk Management Committee, with recommendations made to the Executive Committee and Board of Directors for approval. The admission process will consist of the following:

- Application – to identify loss exposures and current risk management programs.
- Loss History – to further evaluate exposures, how they have impacted the prospective member’s operations, and enable the PLAN’s actuary to project expected losses for the initial program year.
- Audit – in-person interviews with key personnel and review of data, current risk management practices, policies, and procedures. Physical inspection of key facilities, including parks, public works, and administration, to gauge the extent that policies are put in to practice. Review of future plans and safety culture to gauge ability to sustain effective risk control.

B. Continued Membership. The PLAN maintains a set of Risk Management Performance Standards that include recommended and best practices to prevent or minimize losses in a number of key areas. They also include an Expected Standard of Performance that must be met to maintain membership in the PLAN.

The Risk Management Performance Standards are attached to this policy as Exhibit B and are reviewed and updated on a periodic basis.

3.2 Monitor Compliance

The PLAN monitors the implementation and results of each member's risk management program through a number of methods, including self-audits, claims reviews, staff assessments, and use of external experts.

- Self audits – at the end of each calendar year the member is expected to conduct an internal audit of its compliance with the recommended standards and provide a report to the Risk Management Committee. The report should also identify any significant changes in exposures, actions taken to correct any deficiencies, and improvements to the risk management program. The audit may be combined with the claim review and should be used to develop goals and an action plan for the following year.
- Claim Reviews – members receive a quarterly report of their claims activity and are expected to review the report to identify the nature, cause and amount of their claims. Focus should be on determining whether or not the loss was preventable and how to prevent in the future. Results should be shared with department managers and affected employees and measures taken to prevent or reduce the impact of future claims.

PLAN staff also reviews claims reports on a regular basis to identify trends and make recommendations to resolve outstanding claims, implement measures to reduce the frequency and severity of similar claims, and share experiences from other members to prevent similar losses from occurring. Staff should meet with member at least annually for a claim review and recommendations to be included in the member's action plan.

- Staff Risk Assessments – PLAN staff will assist with and review the yearly self-audits to assess progress in implementing the Standards, identify areas for improvement, and share member practices that have resulted in decreased claim frequency and severity. Staff is expected to conduct in-person follow up as needed and a formal audit of each member every 2-3 years.
- Risk Management Assessments – the PLAN will supplement the internal audits described above by conducting audits of each member by qualified experts every 3-5 years. The goal of these audits is to ensure compliance with the minimum standards and to share best practices from inside and outside the PLAN membership.

3.3 Provide Resources

The PLAN shall dedicate resources each year to fund risk management programs to assist members in meeting the Risk Management Performance Standards and to encourage them to take additional actions consistent with the goal of reducing the frequency and severity of their losses. These resources shall be directed to provide training, inspections, equipment, public education, and grants to encourage members to create programs that address their individual needs and share their ideas with other members.

4.0 Delegation of Authority

ABAG is designated as program manager of the PLAN and is responsible for ensuring risk management activities are within the guidelines approved by the members. ABAG shall develop and maintain administrative procedures for ensuring compliance with recommended guidelines. In order to analyze and recommend a strategy for each Program Year, resources shall be allocated to the risk management program. This commitment of resources shall include financial and staffing considerations.

In addition to the duties described in Article VIII 6. of the PLAN Bylaws, the Board assigns the authority to enforce the requirements of the Risk Management Program as described in Appendix II, Section 2.4 of the Revised Risk Coverage Agreement to the Risk Management Committee. The related sections of the Bylaws and Agreement are attached as Exhibit A to this Policy. The Board further assigns the following responsibilities:

- Recommending Risk Management policies and procedures
- Recommending amendments to the Program Memorandum of Coverage based on experience and risk management objectives as outlined in this Policy, and
- Recommending criteria for admission, withdrawal or expulsion of Program Participants to or from the Program and for cancellation of coverage

5.0 Reporting

The Risk Management Committee will annually review how well the PLAN is achieving its risk management goals and benchmarks. In addition to the member self audits, the Risk Manager will submit a yearly report that summarizes losses by cause and department, provides an assessment of risk management programs and funding levels, and offers suggestions for improving results.

6.0 Risk Management Program Benchmarks

Included in the Risk Management Performance Standards is a Risk Management Framework requiring each Member to establish annual risk management goals and objectives. Those individual goals are to be used to benchmark each member's success in reducing the frequency and severity of their claims. Staff will also provide a set of annual goals and objectives for the PLAN as a whole to gauge the effectiveness of risk management programs.

7.0 Policy Adoption

The PLAN's Risk Management Policy shall be adopted by majority vote of the Board of Directors. The policy shall be reviewed annually by the Risk Management Committee and the Board must approve any modification made thereto. The Board of Directors shall adopt mandatory risk management policies and procedures upon a two-thirds (2/3) vote of the members of the Board.

8.0 Definitions

Risk Management – a process of making and implementing decisions that will minimize the adverse effects of losses on an organization, consisting of the following five steps:

- Identify, Analyze and Prioritize Loss Exposures
- Examine Alternative Risk Management Techniques
- Select Apparent Best Risk Management Techniques
- Implement Chosen Techniques
- Monitor Results and Provide Feedback to Improve Results

Exhibit A

Bylaws and Revised Risk Coverage Agreement Provisions Related to the Risk Management Policy

BYLAWS

ARTICLE VIII

COMMITTEES

6. Risk Management Committee. A standing committee consisting of no less than three (3) directors and any other person(s) appointed by the Board shall be charged with the duty and responsibility of:

(a) reviewing and making recommendations to the Board for risk management programs, including but not limited to, voluntary and mandatory program changes in Member activities, and restrictions on coverage,

(b) reviewing and making recommendations to the Board on applications for admissions, expulsion, withdrawal notices and proposals for cancellation, including but not limited to, the terms and conditions under which such admissions, withdrawals, expulsions and cancellations are implemented.

REVISED RISK COVERAGE AGREEMENT

APPENDIX II

LIABILITY PROGRAM PROCEDURES

2.4 Risk Management Program.

(a) Each Member Entity shall appoint an employee of the Member Entity to be responsible for the risk management function within that Member Entity and to serve as liaison between Member Entity and the Corporation as to risk management.

(b) Each Member Entity shall supply the Corporation with information regarding Member Entity's physical facilities, maintenance procedures, operational procedures and any other information regarding the conduct of Member Entity's operations as may be reasonably requested by the Corporation in auditing the Member Entity's risk management practices.

(c) Each Member Entity shall consider all recommendations of the Corporation regarding Member Entity's risk management practices and shall reply in writing describing its acceptance or rejection of the recommendations and any action taken thereon.

(d) Each Member Entity shall maintain its own set of records as a loss log in all categories of loss and shall permit the Corporation to review or obtain a copy of same.

(e) Each Member Entity shall comply with risk management policies and procedures as adopted by the Board of Directors upon a two-thirds (2/3) vote of the members of the Board.



 Association of Bay Area Governments
ABAG PLAN Corporation

**Risk Management Policy
Exhibit B**

Risk Management Performance Standards

**DRAFT
Revised March 11, 2005**

Foreword

The Board of Directors of the ABAG PLAN Corporation (PLAN) has formally adopted the following Risk Management Performance Standards (RMPS). The purpose of these standards is to provide our Members with risk management recommendations that will, when implemented, reduce the potential for losses.

The Standards represent an excellent benchmark to guide risk management practices for our Members. It is also important to realize you are not alone in your risk management efforts. The PLAN staff and consultants can assist you with implementing these Standards and act as a resource to guide you towards reaching our agreed-upon performance goals.

In cases where Members fail to meet the Expected Standards of Performance defined in the RMPS, the Risk Management Committee will be informed, but only after the PLAN staff first attempts to secure a good faith effort on the part of the Member to achieve voluntary compliance with the RMPS.

The PLAN Board and staff look forward to working with each Member to implement these Risk Management Performance Standards.

Risk Management Performance Standards

The four key areas of the Risk Management Performance Standards are identified below:

Risk Management Framework
Loss Experience Trending Factors
Adherence to Risk Management Recommendations
Policies and Procedures

Risk Management Framework

1. The Member must have adopted a formal risk management policy statement developed by the City Manager and distributed to all employees
2. The Member must establish annual written risk management goals and objectives. These goals and objectives must be communicated to all employees.
3. A Risk Management Coordinator must be appointed who is responsible for the implementation of the risk management programs.
4. A Risk Management Committee must be named.
 - a. The committee must hold regular meetings (at least quarterly).
 - b. Written minutes must be kept of each meeting along with an attendance list.
 - c. The committee must review all accidents, claims and losses.
5. The Member is responsible for conducting and documenting at least semi-annually a self-inspection program of member operations and facilities.
6. The member has implemented the appropriate recommended risk management policies and procedures.

Loss Experience Trending Factors

1. Favorable Trending Factors

An uninterrupted downward trend of 15% or more over a three-year period in the Experience Modifier will be interpreted as a sign that the member is demonstrating a consistently strong commitment to sound risk management practices. Members in this category will be recognized by the Risk Management Committee and will be encouraged to share successful strategies with other members.

2. Unfavorable Trending Factors

An uninterrupted upward trend of 15% or more over a three year period in the Experience Modifier will be interpreted as a sign that the member may not be attentive to risk management matters. A member falling into this category will be required to review its commitment to meeting the Performance Standards and submit a written self-appraisal with actions it commits to take to strengthen its risk management program.

Adherence to Risk Management Recommendations

1. Expected Standard of Performance
 - a) Active participation in risk management programs, surveys, and discussions with PLAN staff on strategies to prevent losses.
 - b) Written response within 45 days to recommendations.
 - c) Action is taken to correct hazardous conditions or implement policies and procedures that satisfactorily address 50% or more of the recommendations.

2. Substandard Performance
 - a) Non-participation in risk management programs, surveys and discussions with PLAN staff.
 - b) Lack of written response to recommendations after at least three written attempts to secure a response (@ 75 days elapsed time).
 - c) Failure to act to correct hazardous conditions or implement recommended policies and procedures. Less than 50% of the recommendations have had corrective action.

When a member's performance falls to "substandard" the PLAN staff shall require the member to re-commit in writing to achieve the Expected Standard of Performance with a copy of the response furnished to the Risk Management Committee. The Risk Management Committee may choose to ask the Member for further written explanation of its commitment to the PLAN's RMPS and may invite the Member to a Committee meeting for discussion of the Member's inability to comply with the standards.

The Committee may also elect to report to the full Board its concern about a Member that fails to comply with the expected standards and/or otherwise indicates a lack of commitment to the exercise of sound risk management practices. The Committee may recommend to the Board that action be taken to reduce the risk posed to the Pool by the Member's inaction, including limiting or excluding coverage for damages arising from certain activities, mandating certain action for continued membership, or expulsion.

Policies and Procedures

PLAN staff works with Members, consultants, and the Risk Management Committee to develop a set of recommended risk management policies and procedures for our members. We continue to monitor and revise the recommendations based on claims experience, changes in exposures and liability, and the best practices of our members.

The focus of the recommendations is on those areas that lead to the most claims. The areas currently addressed by the policies include:

- Vehicle Use and Operations
- Sewer Loss Prevention and Maintenance
- Police Operations
- Fire Operations
- Sidewalk Maintenance
- Urban Forest Management
- Facilities Maintenance and Hazard Identification
- Contractor Selection and Control
- Road Maintenance
- Contractual Risk Transfer
- Playground Safety
- Claim Reporting and Follow Up
- ADA Compliance and Transition Plans

The best practices recommended in each of the above categories are listed on the following pages. Members are encouraged to request specific policies and procedures referenced in the best practices from PLAN staff, consultants, or other members as needed. If the member currently has a policy or practice that meets or exceeds the recommendations they are encouraged to share them for review and acceptance.

Operational Best Practices
Vehicle Use and Operations
Member has adopted a comprehensive fleet management program to include driver training (defensive driver training), driver screening and selection, vehicle use, non-owned vehicle use, and vehicle maintenance.
Driver Selection and Training Measures
There is a written program in place that is actively utilized as the basis for driver selection and screening of employees and prospective employees for driving related duties.
There is evidence that employees with negative Motor Vehicle Records (MVR) activity as defined by the ABAG Plan standards are provided personnel counseling, training, rehabilitation, and/or removed from driving responsibilities depending on the nature and seriousness of the activity on their MVR or observed driving behavior.
All employees who drive any vehicle on Agency business are enrolled in the Department of Motor Vehicles Pull Notice Program and MVRs are reviewed to prevent negligent retention. Note: Release required for drivers whose license does not require participation in the PULL program.
Vehicle Maintenance Measures
Vehicles and records are maintained to meet standards and warranties relevant to the vehicles or equipment and to help defend negligence claims.
Vehicle Operations Measures
The City has adopted a vehicle use policy that includes a "distracted driver" policy covering the use of cell phones and other potential in-car distractions.
All vehicle accident investigations reflect any "distracted driver" implication as part of the root cause analysis.
Sidewalk Inspection and Maintenance
Member has adopted a sidewalk/walkway inspection, maintenance, and complaint response plan.
Measures
There is an effective, written City-specific procedure in place to minimize sidewalk defects such as raised offsets, tilts or steep cross slopes, sunken sections, spalling, improper repairs to surround structures such as drains, and offsets between public and private sidewalks.
The City has an ordinance in place transferring the liability for injuries on sidewalks to the property owner.
The City has a written process in place to notice property owners to repair sidewalks where allowed by Municipal Code.
The City has a follow up procedure to ensure defects have been addressed by marking, barricading, etc. within reasonable periods.
The City has a follow up procedure to ensure defects have been mitigated by the property owner or other responsible party within a reasonable period.
Photographs are taken and maintained in Public Works to visually record action taken to guard against contact by the public with a hazardous sidewalk site. This will aid in defense against allegations of inaction by the City.
Urban Forest Management (Trees and Vegetation)
The City has a written urban forest management plan, which includes selection and placement of trees and provides for identification and mitigation of tree/shrub/vegetation related hazards. The City has an ordinance outlining the rights and responsibilities of tree owners.
Measures
The City has passed an ordinance describing its ownership or control of trees in its jurisdiction and the responsibility of property owners to maintain their trees so as not to interfere with public safety or convenience. Failure to do so may result in action by the City and/or liability for the owner for any damages.
There is a written process to select, situate, and maintain trees to minimize hazards, hardscape damage, and maintenance costs.
Urban forest management is under the control and supervision of persons who have the necessary professional credentials and expertise to qualify as an urban forester or arborist.
A written plan is in place and documented to provide for methodical, periodic inspection, care, maintenance, and complaint/emergency response for trees and other vegetation.
Urban forest management plan inspection and monitoring frequency is prioritized by degree of exposure of the public to vegetation hazards. (i.e. obscured intersections, parks, playgrounds) This includes weed abatement and other fire hazards.

Operational Best Practices

Sewer Loss Prevention and Management

The City has an ordinance requiring backflow prevention devices that at a minimum meet the most current plumbing code. The City maintains a written program for risk assessment and review, regular inspection, preventive maintenance, and emergency response for its sanitary sewer system.

Measures

An ordinance is in place that meets or exceeds current plumbing code requirements for backflow devices. Council meeting minutes reflect recommendations and cost justification by staff for adoption of an ordinance requiring backflow devices when events not addressed by the code occur, such as when a property owner suffers a loss, remodels, or sells the property.

Key personnel have been trained to interact with property owners when responding to reports of sewer backup. Training topic outline and document templates are available for review.

A written sewer inspection and maintenance procedure is in place and adherence to the procedure is documented. The protocols include identification and attention to “high frequency or impact areas” of the system.

Police Risk Management

Police risk management is an integral part of the overall City’s risk management exposure and should be subject to the risk assessment and evaluation review process as conducted by representatives from all City departments.

Measures

Member written General Orders (GO’s) or guidelines reflect dates indicating reviews and updates. Key policies are reviewed annually.

Each Member uses a legal liability service or other qualified consultant for updated policy and procedure notification and advice.

Member departments have adopted a “force options” approach to policing. Training records reflect this philosophy.

Code 3 driving standards are in place which reflect current legal liability and professional standards that minimize risk to others sharing roads with emergency vehicles.

Member departments comply with all POST-mandated training requirements, including perishable skills, and training to General Orders is documented.

Digital audio-visual technology in patrol vehicles, and digital audio recorders on person, are used to provide defense against alleged police misconduct claims.

Fire Risk Management

Fire risk management is an integral part of the overall City’s risk management exposure and should be subject to the risk assessment and evaluation review process as conducted by representatives from all City departments.

Measures

The department has a written policy clearly defining if and how emergency response (Code 3) driving is permitted and executed.

The department has equipment, procedures, and training in place to address equipment/gear that may not be enclosed or secure and may fall from the apparatus.

Dispatch has either been transferred to another agency or detailed training, data and communication management, and technology are used to prevent dispatch error.

Facilities Maintenance and Hazard Identification

City owned and/or operated facilities, including those for which joint use agreements are in place, present risk exposures to users and neighboring facilities. A process for scheduled, documented inspection of Member buildings and other facilities should be in place.

Measures

Checklists or other tools used to document inspections are available for review.

Action items are prioritized and are assigned for correction with a due date for completion. Completion date is recorded.

All new or newly acquired facilities have a documented risk assessment review for structural and operational risk.

Buildings that have not been determined to be adequately protected against natural disaster or fire are not used for public gatherings and classes nor leased to others.

Operational Best Practices

Playground Safety

Member playgrounds must be designed, inspected, and maintained in compliance with the State of California requirements, which are described in *The Handbook for Public Playground Safety* and ASTM F187-95.

Measures

A current playground equipment inventory exists for each playground.

An annual playground audit is available for review and reflects equipment as stated in the inventory. The audit is conducted either by a Certified Playground Safety Inspector (CPSI) or personnel trained by a CPSI.

Documented monthly inspections and repair records are available for review. Inspections are conducted and signed off by a CPSI or staff who was trained and overseen by a CPSI.

Depending on frequency and intensity of use, weekly and/or daily inspection checklists are available for audit.

For playgrounds that do not comply with accessibility requirements under the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA), an action plan with time tables to bring the site into compliance is available for review.

Contractor Selection and Control

Additional selection and evaluation criteria are used along with "low bidder" to ensure safe, cost effective, completion of member projects for large projects.

Measures

Member has contractor selection criteria that includes reference and site checks, interviews, insurance loss history, Cal/OSHA citation history, and license verification for general and all subcontractors.

The contractor has a safety program (IIPP) in place.

The contractor has site protection, traffic control, inspection, and debris removal plan in place.

Contracts are reviewed for safety plans, staffing, oversight, and accountability.

Member has documented planning, oversight, and quality control meetings with contractor.

Road Maintenance

Member has a systematic process in place for inspection, maintenance, repair, and emergency response for roadways.

Measures

The City Council and/or City Engineer signs off on all road site protection plans to preserve governmental immunity.

Member has on staff or access to a CalTrans trained work zone safety specialist to oversee and approve all work zones.

To enhance the Member's ability to defend claims, protection of work sites should be documented in photographs to illustrate protection provided to ensure drivers/pedestrians/cyclists do not come in contact with hazardous conditions.

Contract language is signed by contractors accepting responsibility for the clean up and debris removal from work sites to reduce the potential for damage to vehicles or cyclist.

Member has adopted a minimum Pavement Maintenance Index to serve as the standard to which road surfacing is to be maintained. Example: PMI=70

Contractual Risk Transfer

All contracts in which the member is involved are part of the risk management review process. Contracts should have appropriate hold harmless provisions and insurance requirements.

Measures

A contract review process is in place to provide for consistent contract administration and oversight. Contracts contain appropriate hold harmless clauses and insurance requirements.

All contracts are reviewed and approved by legal counsel to ensure that the City is adequately protected and risk is transferred or shared as intended.

Contract administrator obtains required insurance documentation prior to work commencing.

Operational Best Practices

<p style="text-align: center;">Claim Reporting and Follow Up</p> <p>Successful claim resolution is ensured by good communications among claimant, Member, and adjuster with immediate reporting of claims.</p>
Measures
Member has assigned a claims liaison to facilitate flow of information to and from the Member needed to evaluate and resolve claims.
Designees from each Member City are identified and trained to provide claimants with information and address their needs without inappropriately increasing the liability of the City.
All claims are reported promptly to ABAG PLAN for payment or rejection as appropriate. Property damage claims not exceeding 10% of the Member's deductible may be paid directly by the City, and those claims are also reported to ABAG PLAN, to maintain an accurate record of claim frequency and severity and to provide trending information.
<p style="text-align: center;">ADA Compliance and Transition Plans</p> <p>The Congressional passage of the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA), which became effective in 1992, dictates equal access to public buildings and facilities, along with hiring and other EEOC-enforced provisions.</p>
Measures
Members have an ADA transition plan in place.
Documentation verifies action taken on transition plan items.
Five-year budget and development plans reflect budgeting for ADA compliance projects.
Alternative procedures are in place to provide access for disabled persons to buildings and facilities until full structural access is achieved.